

2.1.13

14b (ואאורא כדקאי קאי) → 15b (וידיים תלמידי שמאי והלל גזור)

1. בְּנֵי אִם חָכָם לְבָד וְשָׁמַח לְבִי גַם אֲנִי: מִשְׁלֵי כַּג, טו
2. חָכָם בְּנֵי וְשָׁמַח לְבִי וְאֲשִׁיבָה חֲרָפִי דְבָר: מִשְׁלֵי כַּז, יא

I. Further analysis into גזרה #8 – ידיים

a. *Challenge* (to notion of it being decreed by שמאי והלל): was decreed by (themselves)

i. *Per*: listing series of זוגות who promulgated decrees relating to טומאה וטהרה

1. *ויסוי בני יוחנן*: ordained that ארץ העמים (land outside of Israel) be considered טמא and that glassware be vulnerable to טומאה

2. *שמעון בן שטח*: decreed that metal vessels be vulnerable to טומאה (along with לאשה)

3. *שמאי והלל*: decreed that ידים are טמאות

a. *Proposal*: perhaps "שמאי" and "הלל" here refers to they and their schools

i. *Rejection*: שמואל reported that they decreed 18 גזרות – but remained divided about 18 others

1. *Challenge*: ברייתא reported that they ended up agreeing on those 18

2. *Answer*: they remained divided that day, but the next day came to an agreement

ii. *And*: ר' הונא reported that שמאי והלל (themselves) only disagreed about 3 matters (listed below)

b. *Proposal*: שמאי והלל made a decree that the טומאה is treated like ספק (לתלות) and students ודאי (לשרוף)

i. *Rejection*: אילפא reported that the 1st decree of ידים was לשרוף

c. *Rather*: שמאי והלל decreed – but it wasn't accepted until their students passed the decree

b. *Challenge*: שמואל reported that when המלך decreed שלמה המלך decreed עירובין and נט"י, a בת-קול approvingly cited vv. 1-2

i. *Defense*: שלמה made decree affecting קדשים and שמאי והלל (then ב"ש וב"ה) extended it to תרומה

II. Revisiting עדייות א:א-ג report that שמאי והלל disagreed about 3 matters (listed in גזרות)

a. *First*: minimum amount of dough which is חייב בחלה (קב 2 – הלל; קב 1 – שמאי)

i. *הלכה*: 1.5; as measures were inflated, other numbers used

b. *Second*: amount of מים שאובין that invalidate a מקוה (הלל – 1; שמאי – 9 קבין)

i. *הלכה*: based on testimony from ואבטליון

c. *Third*: retroactive נדה טומאת נדה (שמאי – none; הלל – back to last examination)

i. *הלכה*: follows neither – rather we take the most recent of either last exam or 24 hours back

d. *Question*: isn't there another dispute – the famous dispute (among the זוגות, up to and including שמאי) about סמיכה (הלל ושמאי) about סמיכה – קרבנות יחיד בחג on סמיכה

i. *Answer*: הונא's list only includes disputes where they were only disputants; here, there was a multi-generational מחלוקת in which they took part

III. Revisiting ברייתא that reported the series of גזרות (part 1)

a. *ויסוי בני יוחנן*: decreed that ח"ל is טמא (as well as זכוית כלי)

i. *Challenge* (ר' כהנא): ר' ישמעאל ב"ר יוסי reported, in his father's name, a history of down-spiraling of סנהדרין

1. 180 years: before חרבן, Rome took over rule of א"י

2. 80 years: before חרבן, they decreed טומאה on ח"ל, as well as זכוית כלי

3. 40 years: before חרבן, סנהדרין left locale in הגזית and moved to a place in city (→ דיני נפשות no)

ii. *Proposal*: יוסי ויוסי lived during that period (80 years before חרבן)

1. *Rejection*: they lived well before הלל, who was נשיא 100 years before חרבן

iii. *Proposal*: first decree (יוסי ויוסי) was that the earth of ח"ל was טמא (לשרוף) and air-space was nothing

1. *Challenge*: from אילפא's statement above, we can infer that גזירת טומאת ארץ העמים went through stages – first לתלות, then לשרוף

iv. *Rather*: 1st decree was to "suspend" for contact with earth, ignore air-contact;

1. *Then*: 2nd decree was to "burn" for contact and "hang" for air-contact

2. *Challenge*: טהרות ד:ה – 6 ספקות for which we burn תרומה, includes ספק of earth from ח"ל

a. *And*: עולא reported that these decrees were made in אושא (well after ש"ב)

v. *Rather*: 1st decree was to "suspend" for earth-contact; 2nd decree extended "suspension" to air-contact as well

1. *And then*: in אושא, they extended earth-contact to שריפה, leaving air-contact as תלוי