

2.3.3

38b (משנה ב) → 40a (אנא במירוש שמיע לי)

I. משנה ב: rules of שהייה with other cooking devices

- a. **תנור**: even if fueled with straw etc., may not “put” pot on top or inside
 - i. **ד' יוסף**: assumed that “inside” and “top” are read narrowly → leaning the pot against it is permitted
 1. *Challenge* (**אב"י**): משנה rules (below) that כופח may be like תנור and אסור, or like כירה and מותר
 2. *Implication*: whatever the referent, כירה is permitted
 3. *Analysis*: if context is putting it on top – and כירה isn't גר"ק – not permitted
 - a. *Rather*: must be referring to leaning it – and the תנור is the referent for איסור
 - b. *Defense* (**אב"א**): context is “swept” כופח (and “swept” תנור) → if like תנור, prohibited; if like כירה – מותר
 4. *Support for אב"י* – ברייתא **אב"י** – if a תנור is fueled with e.g. straw and even swept, may not lean, certainly not place on top and most certainly not place inside – and most assuredly if it was fueled with e.g. wood
 5. *But*: a כופח that was fueled with straw – may lean against it, not put on top; if with wood – may not lean
 - ii. **כופח** (smaller stove top): if fueled with straw etc. – like כירה (permitted); if with wood etc. – like תנור (אסור)
 - i. *Question* (**לר' אשי**): what is the heat-retentio/generation of a כופח?
 1. *Answer*: stronger than כירה, not as strong as תנור
 - ii. *Definition of כופח*: single-stove top (place for 1 pot); כירה is a double stove-top
 1. *Support*: **זג**: כלים – if a כירה was split lengthwise – טהורה; width-wise, still a כלי (טהורה)
 - a. *But*: כופח cut either way is no longer a כלי (טהורה)

II. משנה ג: alternate cooking sources

- a. **Eggs**: may not put a raw egg next to a pot filled with hot water so that it boils
 - i. **ד' יוסף**: if he cooked it this way, he is חייב חטאת, per ruling that fish (e.g.) may not be washed in hot water on שבת
 1. *Reason*: that washing makes them edible (::egg was made edible → חייב חטאת)
 - ii. **And**: he may not cook it in fabric (that was heated before שבת)
 - i. **ד' יוסי** permits the latter
 - ii. *Note*: ruling (**שבת כב:ד**) that we may put cold water into the sun for it to heat up must be **ר' יוסי** and not רבנן
 1. *Defense* (**ר"ג**): all agree that cooking in the sun is permitted; in by-products of a fire (e.g. heated fabric) is אסור; their disagreement is about תולדות החמה – תולדות האור רבנן prohibit as precaution against תולדות האור ר' יוסי dissents
- c. **Nor**: may he bury it in sand or dust so that it will fry
 - i. *Question*: why doesn't ר' יוסי dissent here as well?
 1. *Answer1* (**רבה**): he agrees to forbid as a precaution against burying in ash (with coals)
 2. *Answer2* (**ר' יוסף**): he agrees to forbid since he may move dirt (אסור בטלטול) to cover it
 - a. *Split the difference*: if the earth is soft (no concern about moving it, but שמא יטמין ברמץ still a concern)
 3. *Challenge*: רשב"ג permits cooking an egg on a heated roof, but not on heated plaster
 - a. *Defense*: typically, a roof has no dirt on it (no reason to apply גזרה)
 4. *Challenge*: משנה ד – the story of אנשי טבריה
 - a. *Understood*: if we accept רבה's explanation – putting the cold water into חמי טבריה is like “burying”
 - i. *But*: ר' יוסף's explanation doesn't work here – no עפר to be concerned about
 - ii. *Defense*: משנה ד is a comment on the 1st part of our משנה (dispute about תולדות החמה)
 1. *To wit*: רבנן used case to prove that תולדות החמה are forbidden
 - a. *And*: ר' יוסי responded that חמי טבריה are תולדות האור (from fires of גיהנם)

III. משנה ד: geothermal heat

- a. **Story**: Tiberians piped some cold water into חמי טבריה
 - i. *Ruling*: if it was שבת, treated like water that was heated on שבת – both drinking and washing forbidden
 1. *But*: if it was יר"ט, drinking is permitted, washing prohibited

