

2.11.5

100a (משנה ג) → 101b (לא שמה בקיעה)

- I. **חייב**: if he threw something less than ד"א and it rolled further – פטור; if further and it rolled closer – חייב
- a. **ד' יוחנן**: it had to have come to rest first, else 1st stage of זריקה wouldn't be considered his completed act
- i. **Support (ברייתא)**: if the wind pushed it back within ד"א, even if it then went out of ד"א – still פטור
1. **But**: if the wind caught hold of it (after it came to rest) and then moved it about – חייב (for 1st stage)
- b. **דבא**: according to רבנן (*contra* ר"ע – no "קלוטה::הונחה" – even within ג"ט, require הנחה on something)
- i. **מרימר (to רבינא)**: isn't that expressed in our משנה, per יוחנן ר' addendum?
- ii. **justification**: in our משנה, a rolling item isn't about to come to rest
1. **but here**: since it will come to rest, we might think that it doesn't require הנחה if within לבוד – קמ"ל
- II. **משנה ד**: status of the sea and creeks
- a. **Sea**: considered כרמלית – throwing ד"א in the sea is not liable
- b. **Creek**: if רה"ר cuts through it and it is less than ג"ט deep (else it is רה"י), throwing ד"א there is חייב
- i. **Note**: משנה repeats rule of בו ורשות הרבים מהלכת
- ii. **Student (to רבא)**: repeat of מהלכת is understood – teaches that inconvenient הילוך is considered הילוך
1. **But**: any other inconvenient use is not considered תשמיש
2. **However**: they the doubled mention of רקק?
- a. **Answer1 (רבא)**: 1 for summer (ppl. use רקק to cool); 1 for winter (ppl. muddy anyways, don't mind)
- b. **Answer2 (אבוי)**: teaches that even if it is ד"א wide, people still go through (and don't circumnavigate)
- c. **Answer3 (ר' אשי)**: teaches that even if it is smaller than ד"ט wide, people still walk in (and not over)
- i. **ד"א**: consistent – he rules that if someone throws and it lands on bridge, חייב – people walk there
- III. **משנה ה**: throwing from land to sea or vice-versa or from boat to sea or vice-versa or from one boat to another – פטור
- a. **Carrying from boat to boat**: if tied together, permitted; if not, prohibited even if they are near each other
- IV. **Dispute חסדא ר' הונא/ר' חסדא** שבת ר' about how to load water from sea onto boat
- a. **ד' הונא**: stick out a beam of any size
- i. **Reason**: כרמלית (the sea) is measured from ocean floor – this is above ג"ט → מקום פטור; זיז is for היכר alone
- ii. **Challenge (ר'נ)**: sometimes it may be less than 10 from sea floor
1. **Answer (רבה בר אבנה)**: boat never goes in such shallow water; they have men to measure it before boat
- b. **ד' ח**: stick out a frame of 4x4, pull water through hole in middle
- i. **Reason**: כרמלית measured from top of water – without going through frame, carrying from כרמלית → רה"י (boat)
- ii. **Challenge (ר'נב')**: how do they get rid of sewage from boat?
1. **Answer**: they cast it over hull, slides down into water
- a. **Challenge**: it then moves from רה"י → כרמלית via his power (כחו)
- b. **Answer**: כחו was not included in כרמלית
- i. **Proof**: ר' יהודה (in ברייתא) rules that if boat was 10 deep (inside) but not 10 above water, כרמלית
1. **Then**: they may send water out to sea but not bring it in (→ כחו was not forbidden in כרמלית)
- V. **רה"י** and the רב הונא and the מישן-canoes (which were wide above and narrow below, such that the walls didn't make it a רה"י)
- a. **Limitation**: may not carry more than ד"א inside the canoe
- i. **Note**: this is only if there isn't ד"ט at a point lower than ג"ט from bottom of boat – else, permitted
- ii. **Or**: if he filled the bottom with twigs and sticks up to point of ד"ט width, permitted to carry throughout
1. **Challenge (ר'נ)**: why not apply מחיצתא גוד אחית מחיצה "comes down" and imagined to reach floor
- a. **Per**: ריב"י's ruling about the טרסקל (feed basket) put on a stick ג"ט high – considered רה"י
- b. **Counter (רב יוסף)**: חכמים exempt in a case where someone threw to top of טרסקל (i.e. not רה"י)
- i. **Challenge (אבוי)**: ruling that a 10-high pole in רה"ר with ד"ט on top but below is ג"ט – רה"י
- ii. **Response**: in that case, goats cannot get through מחיצה, unlike case of טרסקל (→ גוד אחית no)
2. **Challenge (to אשי)**: in case of boat, we also have fish able to swim past מחיצה – גוד אחית no
3. **Defense (רב אשי)**: fish getting past is not a denigration of the מחיצה
- a. **Proof**: רבין's answer to query about a hanging מחיצה – only works in water (חכמים of קולא)
- i. **In spite of**: fish getting past → בקיעת דגים is not considered a breach of the מחיצה