

2.17.4; 125a (משנה ו) → 126b (סוף הפרק)

- I. שבת: various water-filling devices and their use on שבת
- a. **אבן שבקרויה**: hollow gourd, weighted down with a rock, may be used if the rock is secured and doesn't fall out
- i. **Backdoor**: **סוגיא** **שבת כא:ב** – a rock atop the barrel may be moved by tipping barrel so that it falls off
1. **אסור barrel** → **בסיס לדבר אסור** (ר' **אמי** quoting **רבה** **ר' יוחנן**): only if he forgot it; if put on purpose, becomes אסור
 2. **מותר** → **ר' אסי** quoting **ר' יוסף** (per **ר' יוחנן**): only if he forgot it there; if put on purpose, is cover for barrel
- a. **דבה**: challenge to my approach from 1st clause of our משנה; rock can be considered a proper tool
- i. **Defense**: in our case, it is tied on and becomes part of the כלי, unlike the rock atop the barrel
- b. **ד' יוסף**: challenge to my approach from end of our משנה; if not tied on, may not use
- i. **Defense**: since he didn't tie it on, he was מבטל it and it doesn't function as part of כלי
- c. **Disagreement**: **רבה** requires an affirmative action to make the rock a כלי; **ר' יוסף** doesn't require it
- i. **And**: they are consistent, following their interpretation of the story with **רבי**
 1. **Story**: **רבי** found a row of bricks and told his students to “think about them” for use on שבת
 - a. **רבי** didn't require them to do anything – just think about them
 - b. **ר' יוחנן** **ד' אמי**: he required them to take action (**ד' אמי**: arrange rocks; **ד' אסי**: clean them off)
 2. **Alternate takes**: some think it was a pile of new boards, other – a ship's oar
 - a. **Note**: if **רבי** permitted גשוש, certainly he would allow pile of boards
 - b. **But if**: he permitted boards, he wouldn't allow גשוש – מחמת חסרון כוונה
- b. **זמורה**: a grape vine, which is tied on to the pail, may be used
- i. **Implication**: if not tied on, may not be used
 1. **Observation**: this seems to be **רשב"ג**, who doesn't require palm branches to be tied (חכמים require it)
 2. **Block** (**ר' ששת**): even **רשב"ג** would agree here; in our case, vine is still in ground
 - a. **Challenge**: if still in ground, he is משתמש במחובר (may not use as it is like a tree)
 - i. **Defense 1**: it may have been below ג"ט (dissimilar from tree → מותר)
 - ii. **ד' אשי**: perhaps it was תלוש – but we ban it as a precaution so that he wouldn't cut another
- II. משנה ז: closing up window with פקק (“plug”)
- a. **ד' א**: if it is tied on to the wall and hanging in the air – may be used; failing either – may not be used
- b. **חכמים**: in either case, it may be used
- i. **ד' יוחנן**: they agree that one may not build an אהל – even temporary – on י"ט, and certainly not on שבת
 1. **Dispute**: whether we can add to a preexistent אהל
 - a. **ד' א**: may not add to an אהל קבוע on י"ט – certainly not on שבת
 - b. **חכמים**: may add to an אהל קבוע on שבת, and certainly on טוב יום
 - ii. **Interpretation of חכמים**: meaning of “בין כך ובין כך” (“in either case”)
 1. **ד' כהנא**: whether or not it is tied on, as long as it was set up for this function
 - a. **Challenge** (**ר' ירמיה**): if so, should read “whether or not it is תלוי (hanging)”
 - b. **Per**: **ר' יוחנן**, who identified that the dispute here is paralleled in עירובין י"א
 - i. **עירובין י"א**: a door bolt which is not fixed in to the door may be used in מקדש (no שבות) only
 1. **But if**: it is lying on the ground (not connected) – may not be used anywhere (ר' אליעזר::)
 2. **ד' יהודה**: if it is מונח (not tied on), may be used in מקדש but not in מדינה (חכמים::)
 - c. **Defense** (**ר"כ**): following **רשב"ג** in י"ג: **תוספתא שבת יד:** who allows (**contra** חכמים) a key to be used even מונח
 - i. **And**: **ר' יוחנן** ruled in accord with **רשב"ג**
 1. **Challenge**: **ר' יוחנן**, commenting on משנה ח (below), ruled that the cover must have כלי תורת כלי
 - a. **And**: **רשב"ג** does not require כלי תורת, as evidenced by his ruling about palm branches
 2. **Answer**: **ר' יוחנן** agrees with **רשב"ג** on one account (מונח) but not another (תורת כלי)
- c. **Final ruling**: **ר' יצחק נפחא** ruled in accord with **ר' אליעזר**
- i. **Challenge** (**ר' עמרם**): from שבת כד: – we may put in window plug – even if unconnected (כרבנן)
 1. **Defense** (**אביי**): that סתם follows רבנן; but סתם in י"א follows עירובין י"א
 - a. **Block**: the מעשה quoted in כד: is more compelling evidence – and הלכה follows רבנן
- III. משנה ח: handling covers of vessels
- a. **חכמים**: all vessel covers which have handles may be moved on שבת (→ without handles, may not be moved)
- b. **ד' יוסי**: this limitation only applies to קרקע כסויי (e.g. cistern covers); but כלים כסויי require no handle
- i. **ד' יוחנן**: dispute only if the cover itself has תורת כלי
 1. **Note**: they agree about כסויי קרקע (handle needed) and כסויי כלים – no requirement of a handle
 - a. **Disagreement**: regarding covers of כלים that are anchored to ground (require it קרקע or not?)
 - b. **Alternate**: disagreement only about כסויי תנור – is it similar to כסויי קרקע or כסויי כלים?