

## 3.3.2

28a (אמר רב יהודה) → 28b (הילכתא כוותיה דשמואל)

note #1: definition of "food"

- for **כסף מעשר** even something which is only edible with significant intervention;
- for **טומאת אוכלין** something which is edible with minor addition;
- for **עירוב** something which is edible as is

## I. עירובין's statement regarding acceptable/unacceptable foods for עירובין

- a. **Acceptable:** **פעפועין** (unclear), **חלגלוגות** (probably *portulaca oleracea*) and **גודגיות** (coriander)
  - i. **Challenge:** coriander affect fertility and should be avoided by people without children; if hard – by everyone
  - ii. **Answer:** allowed coriander is soft and for people with children
    1. **Or:** even for people without children; since they are fit for **מרובי בגדים**
    - a) **Per:** allowance to use wine for **נזיר** (out **משנה**)
  - iii. **Alternatively:** רב was referring to Medean coriander, which is not harmful to fertility
- b. **Unacceptable:** **חזיז** (hay)
  - i. **Challenge:** רב himself ruled that we may use **חזיז** (and **כשות**) for an **עירוב** (and the **ברכה** is **בורא פרי האדמה**)
    1. **Resolution:** before רב came to **בבל**, ruled it out; after he arrived in **בבל** (& saw that they ate it there) – included
    2. **Challenge:** does **בבל** constitute a majority of the world? (i.e. does its custom determine universal usage?)
      - a) **Support:** status of vegetables follows typical usage, in spite of individual's deviance from norm
    3. **Answer:** רב's 2<sup>nd</sup> ruling was re: garden hay, which is eaten
    4. **Story:** **זירא** ר' heard ruling that the **ברכה** on hops is **בפה"א**; on **חזיז** – **שהכל**
      - a) **זירא** ד' thought just the opposite – since **חזיז** grows from ground, hops from air
      - b) **But:** הלכה follows "child" (!) – since hops is a complete **פרי**, unlike **חזיז**
        - i. **Note:** ר' זירא was wrong in his distinction – hops, if cut off, dies (→ grows from ground)
- c. **Unacceptable:** **כפניות** (unripe dates)
  - i. **Challenge:** **כסף מע"ש** – **תוספתא מע"ש א: יד** – hearts-of-palm are bought with **מע"ש**, but are not vulnerable to **טר"א**,
    1. **And:** **כפניות** are both bought with **כסף מעשר** and are vulnerable to **טר"א**
    2. **Challenge:** **ד' יהודה** – hearts-of-palm are considered a tree for all matters, except this (may be bought with **מע"ש**)
      - a) **And:** **כפניות** are considered a **פרי** for all matters, except that they are exempt from **מעשרות**
        - i. **Note:** ר' יהודה seems to be in agreement with **ת"ק** – both rule that **קור** is bought with **מע"ש** (still no **אוכלין** – ר"י)
          1. **Answer1** (**אבני**): they disagree in a case if it was fried or boiled, even inedibles can get **טר"א**
            - a. **Challenge** (**רבא**): all agree that if fried or boiled, even inedibles can get **טר"א**
            2. **Answer2** (**רבא**): they disagree about the **ברכה**
              - a. **Per:** disagreement between **רב יהודה** and **שמואל**:
                - i. **בפה"א** **דב יהודה** – it's a fruit
                - ii. **שהכל** **שמואל** – it will eventually harden (הלכה)
                - iii. **Concession:** a radish will also harden, but we say **בפה"א**
                - iv. **Block:** people plant the radish for the hard part, not so with a palm tree
  3. **Answer:** ר' יהודה was referring to a certain type of dates that never get more ripe → considered full **פרי**
    - a) **Challenge:** in such cases, ר' יהודה would not consider **במעשרות**,
    - b) **Per:** ר"י ruled that **ביתיוני** (and **אהיני טובניא**) were only mentioned in re **מעשרות**
      - i. **Meaning:** they are **במעשרות** (→ ר' יהודה finds such fruit to be **במעשרות**)
  4. **Rather:** ר' יהודה was referring to "regular" **כפניות** (that would ripen further)
    - a) **But:** for **טר"א**, they are already considered food
      - i. **Per:** ר' יוחנן's comment that they could be sweetened and made edible by fire (cooking)
      - ii. **In re:** dispute about small and large almonds, sweet and bitter
        1. **ד' אילעא** ruled that all are exempt
        2. **ד' יוחנן** reason for position that all are liable – since they could be cooked and made sweet