

## 3.5.3

55a (תנו רבנן) → 55b (לא צריכא להשלים)

## I. עיבור העיר - תוספתא ד:ד.

a. *Measure as is*: rectangle or square

- i. *Rectangle*: we don't square it
- ii. *Square*: even if it doesn't conform to the compass

b. *Enhanced*: circular, tapering, jutting houses, semicircle

- i. *Circular*: we "create" a square around the city and measure from there
- ii. *Tapered*: we take widest side as base of the square
- iii. *Houses (or pieces of wall) jutting out*: outermost forms base of square
  1. *Even if*: they jut out from 2 sides
  - iv. *Semicircle (or other shape)*: we imagine the gap to be built up with homes and measure from there
    1. *אמות 4*: only if distance between 2 ends is 4 אמות or less
      - a) *However*: if it is greater – we measure from the actual houses along the "bow"
      - b) *Challenge*: ר"ה ruled that if a city was destroyed in the middle
        - i. *If*: the desolate area is over 141 אמות, considered 2 cities; else – still one city
        - ii. *Answer*: in our case, only one side "open" (middle of "bow"); there – both sides open
      - iii. *Challenge*: ר"ה already taught that in context of next משנה
        1. *According to חכמים*: a city is divided if there is a קרפף between the halves
          - a. *ה"ה*: a קרפף for each half (i.e. 141 אמות)
        2. *Answer*: both needed –
          - a. *If*: we only taught "the broken wall", סד"א because that was originally מותר
          - b. *And if*: we only taught "2 towns", סד"א each needs its own קרפף (too little for 2 towns)

2. *Question*: how much room is allowed between houses and "added line"?

- a) *אמות 2000*: דבה בר רב הונא
- b) *רבא בריה דרבה בר רב הונא* (*his son*): even more
  - i. *אב"י*: supports דרבה בר רב הונא – because he could walk via the semi-circle of houses

## II. Analysis of clause #2 in our משנה - the גודיות

a. *Definition*: ruined homes with 3 walls and no roof

- i. *Question*: what about a house with a roof – but only 2 walls?
- ii. *Answer*: from ברייתא defining extensions:
  1. *Acceptable*: mausoleum (4 אמות x 4 אמות),
    - a) *And*: bridge and cemetery with residence, בית כנסת with residence for teacher
    - b) *And*: pagan temple with manse, stables and storage sheds with residence,
    - c) *And*: guard houses, homes on a spit/isle (used for storing cargo or boat equipment)
  2. *unacceptable*: mausoleum with two walls missing
    - i. *possible proof*: this may even include a 2-walled structure with a roof
    - ii. *rejection*: only means if it has no roof
    - b) *nor*: bridge and cemetery *without* residence, ביהכ"נ *without* residence for teacher
    - c) *nor*: pagan temple *without* manse, stables and storage sheds *without* residence
    - d) *nor*: pits, caves, fences and dove-cotes
      - i. *challenge*: ר' חייא taught that a cave is included with city
      - ii. *answer*: that is only if there is a residence at the mouth of the cave
        1. *and*: the residence doesn't have the requisite size (ד"א אד"א) without the פי-המערה
          - a. *therefore*: the cave does extend the residence to the proper size,
            - i. *but*: is not in and of itself a residence
  - e) *nor*: boat cabin – used to offload vessels from boat