

4.5.3

59b (משנה ב') → 61a (פסול) (בזמנו ופסול)

- Note: *מחשבה* plays a central role in *קדשים*. Each of the 4 *עבודות* (*זריקה*, *הולכה*, *קבלת הדם*, *שחיטה*) must be done with the proper *מחשבה* or, at least, without an improper *מחשבה*. Nearly all *קרבנות* which are offered with intent for a different type of *קרבן* - e.g. an *עולה* brought *לשם שלמים* - are valid, although they are not reckoned to the account of the donor. *פסח* is one of the famous exceptions to this rule - if brought with explicit intent for a *שלמים* (e.g.), it is invalid
- Note: there is a dispute in *תמורה מס'* between *ר' מאיר* and *ר' יוסי* as to whether we consider a person's entire statement even though part A contradicts part B (*ר' יוסי*), or whether we accept part A and ignore part B (*ר' מאיר*).
- Note: a *פסח* which is offered at any other time (other than the afternoon of the 14th) is a valid *שלמים* - unless it is offered *לשם פסח*. Here, "wrong" *מחשבה* may render it valid.

I. *מחשבה*: Improper משנה ב'

- a. *פסול* - *לשם שלמים* or partially *לשם שלמים* - is *פסול* if a *פסח* is offered *לשם שלמים*.
- b. Whether: the 1st or last *עבודה* - or any of the 4 *עבודות* (see note) are done *לשם שלמים*
 - i. Authorship of *משנה ר"מ* OR *ר' יוסי* (see note)
 1. Question: is *לשמו* within 1 *עבודה* or only if an entire *עבודה* was performed *לשמו*
 - a) Note: issue only relevant re: *לשמו* and *לשמו* (ר"מ would agree that if 1st *מחשבה* was *לשמו* - *פסול* - *לשמו* - *לשמו* - *לשמו*)
 2. proof for *ר' יוסי* as author: from 2nd clause - *לשמו* and *לשמו* - even within 1 *עבודה* it's invalid
 - a) rejection: 2nd clause may refer to multiple intents at point of *שחיטה* (*לשם שלמים*) *זריקה* (שחיטה לשמה *זריקה* לשם *שלמים*)
 - b) implication: *זבחים* י. - ר"מ's attach - *מחשבין מעבודה לעבודה*
 3. proof for *ר' יוסי* from 3rd clause: *לשמו* and *לשמו* must certainly be within 1 *עבודה* (if 2 *עבודות*, certainly *פסול*)
 - a) therefore: 2nd clause must also be within 1 *עבודה* (→ *ר' יוסי*)
 - b) rejection: parallel construction (3rd clause is essentially superfluous)
 4. proof for *ר"מ*: 1st clause of *משנה ג*: *מחשבה פסולה* (wrong group) is clearly within 1 *עבודה* → our *משנה* 1 - *עבודה* 1
 - a) rejection: each is judged independently (our *משנה* may still be 2 *עבודות*)
 5. proof: from 2nd clause of *משנה ג*: mixed *מחשבה* (partial wrong group) clearly within 1 *עבודה* → ours also 1 *עבודה*
 - a) argument: if it were 2 *עבודות*, no reason for wrong group to affect *זריקה*: *זריקה* *אין מחשבת אוכלין בזריקה*
 - b) rejection: each is judged independently (our *משנה* may still be 2 *עבודות*)

II. Question: status of a *פסח* bought with "mixed" intent during the rest of the year

- a. *דימי*: just as *לשמה* doesn't "save" it from *לשמה* on יד, *לשמה* doesn't "save it" from *לשמה* other times
- b. *זבחים*: *לשמה* is stronger as it applies (as a *פסול*) to all *זבחים*
- c. *דבא*: valid, since the default is *לשמו*, yet saying *לשמו* "saves it"
 - i. Challenge (*ר' אדא בר אהבה*): perhaps the statement "*לשמו*" is stronger than the default (and harms it)
 1. Proof: wrong "group-think" (*לשמו* *לא אוכליו*) invalidates, but stating both (*לשמו* *לא אוכליו*) is still *כשר*
 - a) Even though: the default is *לא אוכליו*
 2. Defense: the "default" of *לא אוכליו* must be defined, since they could change groups, unlike the *לשמה* of the *קרבן*

III. Question: what is the status of a *פסח* brought for the "wrong donor" (*שינוי בעלים*) during the rest of the year

- a. *ר"פ* (*presented to דבא*): just like *שינוי קודש* invalidates on יד and "saves" any other time, similarly *שינוי בעלים*
 - i. Challenge (*דבא*): disanalogous: *שינוי קודש* has following characteristics:
 1. invalidity in its self (statement about *קרבן*, not owners, who are ancillary)
 - a) Note: this distinction is weak, since both cases are about "intent"
 2. Application: to all 4 *עבודות* (*שינוי בעלים*) only applies to *זריקה* in other *קרבנות*
 3. Duration: exists after life of donor
 - a) Note: this distinction isn't perfect; *ר' פנחס בריה דר' אמי* holds that *לשמה* *לאחר מיתה* holds that *לשמה* *לאחר מיתה*
 4. Affected population: applies to public as well as private *קרבנות*
- b. *פסול* → יד without owners on *פסח* the rest of the year: *שינוי בעלים* *דבא*