

6.1.5

7a (דלא הוה כולי האי) → 8b (שתיים כהלכתן)

1) וְשִׁמְתָה שָׁם אֶת אֲרוֹן הָעֵדוּת וְסִפְתָּ עַל הָאֵזֶן אֶת הַפְּרָכָת: שְׁמוֹת מ, ג

- I. Application of minimalist walls for **שבת** to **סוכה**
- a. **דבא**: since **טפח+2** is valid for **סוכה**, it comprises valid **מחיצות** for **שבת** during **סוכות** (i.e. the **סוכה** itself)
    - i. Reasoning: **מיגו**
    - ii. Challenge (to application of **מיגו**): **שבת** is more severe than **סוכה**, requiring majority standing
      1. Meaning: **שבת** of **סוכות** is more severe than **הלכות סוכה**
      2. Rather: **שבת** during the year is more severe than **שבת סוכות**, due to **מיגו**
    - iii. Challenge: should read that **סוכה** requires “**טפח**” during the week, only **לחי** on **שבת**
      1. Defense: no need to mention it, since we already apply leniencies, **ק”ו** we apply stringencies
  - b. Tangent: **רבא** stated that if you place **סכך** over a **מבוי** with a **לחי**, it is valid
    - i. Note: **רבא** stated same law re: placing **סכך** over **ביראות** **פסי ביראות** (פ”ב)
    - ii. Justification: if only stated re: **מבוי** **סד”א**, since there are 2 “real” walls
      1. And: if only stated re: **פסי ביראות** **סד”א**, since there are 4 walls (so to speak)
      2. And if: stated both of these but not the application to **שבת**, **סד”א** we don’t apply it **לחומר**
- II. Analysis of requirement that majority of **סוכה** not be in sun
- a. **חכמים**: sun that comes through **סכך** alone invalidates
  - b. **ד’ יאשיה**: even sun that comes through walls invalidates, following v. 1 (**פרכת** is a **מחיצה** but called **סככה**)
    - i. **חכמים**: teaches that it should be bent a bit
    - ii. Observation (**אביי**): all of these **חכמים** hold **קבע דירת**
      1. **דבני**: requires **4X4** **אמות** for area of **סוכה**
      2. **ד’ יאשיה**: as above (walls providing shade)
      3. **ד’ יהודה**: allows over 20 **אמות**
      4. **ד’ שמעון**: requires 3+ walls
      5. **דבנן גמליאל**: invalidates **סוכה** atop boat
      6. **”אחרים”**: invalidate(s) **סוכה** without a roof (lean-to)
- III. **סוכה** ר’ **יוחנן**
- a. **שעור**: if it can seat 24 people, valid
    - i. Premise1: average person takes 1 **אמה** of width
    - ii. Premise2: 1 **אמה** of diameter → 3 **אמות** of width
      1. Challenge: should need only 12 people ( $12/3=4$  **אמות**)
        - a. Answer: perimeter of 4 sides of square > circle with that diameter
        - b. Challenge: differential is  $1/4$  → should only need 16 people
          - i. Answer: **ר’ יוחנן** requires a circumscribed circle
          - ii. Challenge: per Pythagoras, should need 16.8 **אמות**
          - iii. Answer: **ר’ יוחנן** doesn’t count space taken by people sitting there
            1. Now: we need 6 (not 8) **אמות** → we need 18 people,
            2. Even though: 16.8 is enough, the measure is inexact. QED