

6.1.15

18a (אמר אביי) → 19b (לו טבילה)

- I. Various הלכות relating to אויר and פסול סוכה
- a. **אביי**: metal staves filling ג"ט do not invalidate unless it is a minimal סוכה
  - b. *Applying לבוד* in the middle of the סוכה is a dispute ר' אחא/רבינא
    - i. *In favor*: as per הלכה of boards re: עירוב (counter – boards are דרבנן)
    - ii. *Against*: as per משנה re: טומאת אהל (counter – הלכות אהל are *sui generis*)
  - c. **ד' יהודה**: house with a hollowed roof – only valid until ד"א
    - i. *2<sup>nd</sup> ruling*: regarding the permission to eat a certain fish
- II. סוכה using the portico
- a. *If*: the portico has pillars – valid
  - b. *If*: it has no pillars:
    - i. **אביי**: valid, we consider the edge of the roof to descend
    - ii. **דבא**: invalid, we do not consider the edge of the roof to descend
      1. *Challenge*: to **אביי** – even if the middle wall (i.e. back of חצר, part of house) was diminished, should be valid, following פי תקרה יורד וסותם
      2. *Defense*: accede the point, since that's similar to a מבוי המפולש
    - iii. *Attempt*: to align רבא/אביי with רב/שמואל re: a portico in a field (שמואל – prohibited, since we don't apply פי תקרה יורד וסותם; רב – permitted following פי תקרה)
      1. *Rejection*: all agree that שמואל's position applies here
        - a. *רב's position*: **אביי** applies it;
        - i. **דבא**: even רב would agree that we don't apply פי תקרה here; here, the walls were not made for the portico
      2. *Challenge*: to **אביי** from our משנה – why not apply פי תקרה to the portico?
        - a. *Answer*: case where the roof is no higher (there is no visible פי תקרה)
  - c. *Alternate version (פומבדיתא)*: if no pillars, all agree invalid;
    - i. *If*: it has pillars, רבא/אביי disagree on application of לבוד – we reject this version
    - ii. *Strory*: אשי & ר' כהנא w/portico w/no pillars
      1. *But*: indented (or extended) shape is considered like a פצימין::לחי
- III. "hangover" – סוכה – "סוכה מן הסוכה" is judged to be like a סוכה
- a. **עולא**: only valid if there are 3 walls on that side, wide/long enough and majority shade – סד"א – since the סוכה was placed there for the inside, invalid, קמ"ל
  - b. **דבה ור' יוסף**: some of the sticks and 1 of the walls continues on – חידוש that it is considered part of the סוכה and therefore has proper size
  - c. **ד' יוחנן**: majority shade, but one spot that is majority sun – "יוצא" → from סוכה
  - d. **ד' אושעיא**: less than ג"ט in a minimal סוכה – better than אויר (you can sleep under it)
    - i. *Challenge*: no precedent for something invalid but can be reckoned towards a valid mass
    - ii. *Answer*: soft mud, reckoned towards מ' סאה for מקוה but cannot itself be used for immersion