

6.3.5

33b → 34b (משנה ג)

(1) ולקחתם לכם ביום הראשון פרי עץ הדר כפת תמרים וענף עץ עבת וערבי נחל ושמחתם לפני ה' אלהיכם שבועת ימים: ויקרא כג, מ
(2) ויקח מזרע הארץ ויתנהו בשדה זרע קח על מים רבים צפצפה שמו: יחזקאל יז, ה

- I. ערבה: parameters of validity for משנה ג
- Essential invalidity*: stolen or withered
 - Theoretical nonexistence*: if coming from אשירה tree or הנדחת עיר
 - Local issues*: if the top was cut off or the leaves fell off – invalid
 - Unique issue*: a צפצפה is invalid
 - However*: if sere, or if some of the leaves fell off or if it is from שדה הבעל (rain-fed orchard) – valid
- II. defining ערבה (all interpreting v. 1)
- #1 **נחל ערבי**: that grow by the river-bed ("נחל" read as location) OR
 - Leaves*: that have leaves that are elongated like a river-bed ("נחל" as adjective)
 - #2 **נחל ערבי**: use of the plural extends to ערבות that grow in mountains and in שדה הבעל
 - Dissent*: אבא שאול reads the plural as alluding to 2 ערבות – מקדש and לולב – ערבות
 - עירבי*: have a tradition (along with נטיות עשר and ניסוח המים) for מצות ערבה – "ערבי" extends to הרים etc.
 - #3 **נחל ערבי**: **excludes** צפצפה and that which grows in the mountains
 - Source* (ר' זירא): v. 2 – "שמו" indicates that it wasn't there before
 - Challenge* (אבוי): perhaps the text is explaining that a צפצפה grows by the water
 - Response*: then it shouldn't say וישמו
 - Defense*: per ר' אבהו – Aggadic take on phrase
 - Alternate version*: of above repartee – ברייתא quoted verse and ר' זירא was the one to challenge
 - #4 **נחל ערבי**: distinguishing צפצפה from ערבה
 - נחל ערבי*: has reddish stem, leaves are smooth and elongated
 - נחל ערבי*: has whitish stem, leaves are serrated "like a scythe" and round
 - Challenge*: ברייתא rules that if the ערבה is serrated like a scythe – valid; like a saw – פסול
 - Answer* (אבוי): the חילופא גילא – a type of ערבה – is valid, yet has scythe-like leaves
 - observation* (אבוי): חילופא גילא is a valid ערבה
 - justification*: since it has a nuanced name, סד"א it is invalid
 - reason*: ערבי (plural) extends to allow variants
 - Tangential note* (ר' חסדא): 3 things have "switched" names after the חורבן
 - ערבה is called צפצפה, and צפצפה is ערבה – implications for מינים
 - שופר is called חצוצרה and vice-versa – implications for ר"ה
 - פתורה (table): → פתורתא (little table); פתורה → פתורה (big table) – implications for commerce
 - אבוי: added הובלילא and כסי (parts of animal's stomach) – implications for טריפות
 - גטי נשים and בורסיף and בבב דבא בר ר' יוסף switched names – implications for נשים
- III. משנה ד: amount of each מין to collect (all opinions anchored in v. 1, per ברייתא)
- ערבות 2 and 3, אתרוג 1, לולב 1 ד' ישמעאל
 - הדסים (but only 1 need be uncut) and 3, אתרוג 1, לולב 1 ד' ישמעאל
 - הדסים need to be uncut
 - 1 of each ד' ע
 - אחריו stays separate from rest, per lack of החיבור ור"ה before תמרים
 - Source*: for their mutual interdependence: ולקחתם – a "complete" taking ("לקיחה תמה")
 - Challenge*: to ר' ישמעאל's position – he seems to require 3, yet allows for only 1 הדור
 - Answer* (ביראה): he changed his mind and allowed for only 1 הדס
 - Ruling* (שמואל): ר' טרפון
 - Note*: שמואל is consistent – he advised הדס-sellers that if they raise prices, he'll publicize כר"ט
 - Argument*: he wasn't threatening the most lenient available position – would've said כר"ע
 - Rejection*: perhaps ר' ט's position is more lenient than ר"ע
 - Reasoning*: easier to find 3 cut הדסים than 1 uncut