

6.3.7; 35b (עלתה חזוית) → 36b (אין זה הדר)

(ז) עֶשֶׂר תִּעֲשֶׂר אֶת כָּל תְּבוּאֹת זֶרַע הַיֵּצֵא הַשָּׂדֶה שְׁנָה שְׁנָה: דְּבָרִים יד, כב

- I. אתרוג – משנה ו
- a. **חזוית**: if it has bubbles on a majority of the אתרוג – invalid
    - i. *However*: if it only covers a minority – valid
    - ii. **ר' חסדא** (version 1): **רב** ruled that it is only invalid if it is one place; if spread out – valid
      1. *Challenge* (**רבא**): if spread out, it is “spotted” and invalid
    - iii. **ר' חסדא** (corrected): **רב** ruled that it is only *valid* (if מעוט) if in one place; if 2 or more – **פסול** → מנומר
    - iv. **רבא**: if it is on the חוטם (from slope to top) – any חזוית invalidates
  - b. **פטמה**: if the פטם (stem of the flower) is gone – invalid
    - i. *version*: **ר' יצחק בן אלעזר** בוכנתו (may be same as פטמה or references the stem)
    - ii. *However*: if the stem is removed – still valid
  - c. **נקלף**: if it is peeled – it is invalid
    - i. **רבא**: if it is peeled to the rind – valid
    - ii. *Resolution*: if it is completely peeled – valid; if partially – invalid (מנומר)
  - d. **נקב**: if a hole was made in it – and any bit is missing – invalid
    - i. *However*: if a hole was made and nothing is missing – still valid
    - ii. *Version* (**עולא בר חנינא**): if the hole goes all the way through (מפולש) – invalid at any שער
      1. *But if*: it doesn't go through (אינו מפולש) – שער is the size of an איסר-coin
  - e. **גושי**: an Ethiopian אתרוג is invalid
  - f. **גרוק ככרתי**: if it leek-green, **ר"מ** validates and יהודה invalidates
- II. **רבא's question**: if an אתרוג has טריפה – is it still valid?
- a. *Cannot mean*: peeled, cracked or had a hole in it – already mentioned
  - b. *Means*: per יוחנן **ר'** ruling that if the inside of the lung “melts” to fluid – still כשרה, and
    - i. **רבא**: commented that it is only כשרה is the sacs are still intact; same requirement for אתרוג
      1. *Perhaps*: in that case, the sacs protect the lungs from oxidization; but in the case of the אתרוג, it is exposed (so it is a “טריפה” nonetheless) or perhaps his distinction holds?
  - c. *Proposed answer*: a bloated or soured, pickled, boiled, black, white or spotted אתרוג is פסול
    - i. *Assumption*: “bloated” is on the outside, סרוח on the inside (i.e. **רבא's** case)
      1. *Rejection*: both are on the outside - could be just bloated or just soured
    - ii. **גושי**: challenge from ברייתא which validates
      1. *Answer1* (**אבוי**): actual כושי (from Africa) is valid; דומה לכושי (grown elsewhere) פסול
      2. *Answer2* (**רבא**): depends on locale – if it's considered normal locally, valid
  - d. *Continuation of ברייתא*: if round like a ball – פסול – some add “twinned” אתרוג as invalid.
    - i. **ר"ע בוסר** invalidates; חכמים render it כשר
      1. **ר"ש** and **ר"ע דבה** have common approach; **ר"ש** exempts small אתרוגים from מעשר
      2. **אבוי**: perhaps **ר"ע** only rejects בוסר due to requirement of הדר
        - a. *And*: perhaps **ר"ש** only exempts from מעשרות per v. 1
    - ii. **דפוס**: if he used a mold to shape it into some other shape – פסול
      1. **רבא**: only invalid if it looks like a different thing; but if it looks like an אתרוג – valid
        - a. *Justification* (in spite of **משנה's** “כבריה אחרת”): if he made it in sections
  - e. **רבא**: an אתרוג that mice nibbled at is פסול
    - i. *Challenge*: **ר' חנינא** would take a bite out of the אתרוג – and then use it for the מצוה!
      1. *Clarification*: he would do that on remaining days (when הדר is no longer a factor)
      2. *Defense*: mice nibbling at it makes it disgusting – worse than a human bite
    - ii. *Note*: some read that **רבא** validated עכברים, נקבוהו עכברים, supported by **ר' חנינא**
- III. משנה ז: minimum and maximum sizes of אתרוג
- a. *Minimum*: **ר"מ** – size of nut; יהודה – **ר'** כביצה (note: parallel dispute re: בית הכסא on שבת)
  - b. *Maximum*: יהודה – **ר'** 2 should fit in one hand; **ר' יוסי** – even if one take both hands to hold
    - i. **ר' יוסי ברייתא** related that **ר"ע** came into ביהכ"נ with אתרוג over his shoulder
      1. *Retort*: חכמים told him that it wasn't הדר