

29.8.5

82a → 83b (משנה ו) → 82a

1. וְזָבַח פֶּסַח לַה' אֱלֹהֶיךָ צֹאן וּבָקָר בַּמָּקוֹם אֲשֶׁר יִבְחַר ה' לְשַׁכֵּן שְׁמוֹ שָׁם: דברים טז, ב
2. וְהָיָה כִּי יִבְיָאֵךְ ה' אֶל אֶרֶץ הַכְּנַעֲנִי וְהַחִתִּי וְהָאֱמֹרִי וְהַחִוִּי וְהַיְבוּסִי אֲשֶׁר נִשְׁבַּע לְאַבְרָהָם לְתֶת לְךָ אֶרֶץ זָבַת חֶלֶב וּדְבַשׁ וְעַבְדָּתָ אֶת הָעֵבֶרָה הַזֹּאת בְּחֹדֶשׁ הַזֶּה: שמות יג, ה
3. וְיִקַּח מִשֶּׁה חֲצִי הַדָּם וְיָשִׁים בְּאַנְתּוֹת וְחֲצִי הַדָּם יִזְרַק עַל הַמִּזְבֵּחַ: שמות כד, ו
4. וְיִשְׁלַח אֲבָרְהָם אֶת יְדוֹ וְיִקַּח אֶת הַמַּאֲכָלֶת לְשַׁחֵט אֶת בְּנוֹ: בראשית כב, י
5. וְיִשָּׂא אֲבָרְהָם אֶת עֵינָיו וַיֵּרָא וְהִנֵּה אֵיל אַחֵר נֹאֲחֵז בְּסִבְבּוֹ בְּקַרְנָיו וַיִּלָּךְ אֲבָרְהָם וַיִּקַּח אֶת הָאֵיל וַיַּעֲלֵהוּ לְעֹלָה תַחַת בְּנוֹ: בראשית כב, יג
6. כָּל זָכָר בְּתֵנִינִים יֵאָכְלֶנּוּ בַּמָּקוֹם קָדוֹשׁ יֵאָכֵל קֹדֶשׁ קִדְשִׁים הוּא: ויקרא ז, ו
7. בְּקֹדֶשׁ הַקִּדְשִׁים תֹּאכְלֶנּוּ כָּל זָכָר יֵאָכֵל אֹתוֹ קֹדֶשׁ יְהִי לָךְ: במדבר יח, י
8. וְהִקְרִיב אֹהֶלֶן אֶת פֶּר הַחֲסִטָּא אֲשֶׁר לוֹ וְכִפֹּר בְּעֹדוֹ וּבְעֹד בֵּיתוֹ: ויקרא טז, ו
9. אֲשֶׁר צִוָּה ה' אֶת מֹשֶׁה בְּהַר סִינַי בַּיּוֹם צִוָּתוֹ אֶת בְּנֵי יִשְׂרָאֵל לְהִקְרִיב אֶת קַרְבְּנֵיהֶם לַה' בַּמִּדְבָּר סִינַי: ויקרא ז, לח
10. וְאִם מִן הַצֹּאן קַרְבְּנֵוֹ לְזָבַח שְׁלָמִים לַה' זָכָר אוֹ נִקְבָּה תָּמִים יִקְרִיבֶנּוּ: ויקרא ג, ו
11. אִם קֶשֶׁב הוּא מִקְרִיב אֶת קַרְבְּנֵוֹ וְהִקְרִיב אֹתוֹ לִפְנֵי ה': ויקרא ג, ז
12. וְאִם עֹז קַרְבְּנֵוֹ וְהִקְרִיבוֹ לִפְנֵי ה': ויקרא ג, יב

- I (משנה ה' per unless otherwise stipulated, source for obligation to bring תודה from חולין)
1. Source: v. 1 – noting that פסח cannot come from בקר, must associate anything that comes from flock and herd to פסח
- i Just as: פסח is an obligation and must come from חולין, so too anything which is חובה must come from חולין
- ii Therefore: if one generates a חובה by taking a נדר “הרי עלי תודה” or “הרי עלי שלמים” – must come from חולין
2. In any case: נסכים must always come from חולין (not from מע"ש, since it must be used for something to be eaten or drunk)
- II Source for פסח itself: ברייתא
1. פסח דורות: פסח דורות: פסח מצרים (both called “פסח”); just as פסח מצרים came from חולין (no מע"ש operating yet), so too דורות פסח מצרים
2. cannot prove from פסח מצרים, as that was אפשר אי (no possibility of מע"ש)
- i even though it is impossible – good proof nonetheless (as these are only references to “פסח”)
- ii פסח מצרים is unlike דורות פסח, as it has no blood/אימורים procedures
- 1 (challenge: if ר"ע holds to principle of אפשר משאי אפשר, אין דנין אפשר משאי אפשר, he shouldn't shift arguments; if he relinquished principle, this one could be challenged as well from פסח מדבר (in במדבר ט
- 2 (answer: ר"ע was speaking to ר"א's approach – if you reject the אין דנין argument, this still defeats)
- 3 v. 2 compares all פסחים to each other → פסח דורות must be like פסח מצרים (not from מע"ש)
- (a) (challenge: why didn't ר"א defeat ר"ע's argument from פסח מדבר?
- (b) (answer: he was responding to ר"ע according to his approach that אפשר משאי אפשר
- (c) (question: why didn't ר"ע challenge him again from אפשר?
- (d) (answer1 (ר' ששת): this proves that one cannot defeat a היקש with reasoning)
- (e) (answer2 (the “בית מדרש”): we cannot use something inferred via היקש (פסח דורות) to inform via another היקש (פסח and other obligations); rather, ועבדת puts all פסחים under one rubric)
3. Question: what is ר"ע's source for rule that חובה may not come from מע"ש?
- i Answer: his take on interpretation and application of list of קרבנות in v. 3 to be used as models:
- ii (quoted by שמואל ר' אליעזר): each קרבן listed there informs rest of list about one rule
- 1 requirement of כלי (doesn't mean מזרק – that is written re: שלמים – v. 4) – knife (for שחיטה)
- (a) Source: v. 5 – and עקידה was an עולה (v. 6)
- 2 זכרי כהונה only eaten by מנחה
- (a) Can't be: in re: חטאת ואשם, which are written explicitly (v. 7)
- (b) Nor: שלמי צבור, inferred from extra phrase in v. 8
- (c) Answer: some infer from v. 8, some from v. 3
- 3 מקדש is בלוע חטאת (see: צז: זבחים)
- 4 just as placenta of אשם is not קדוש; neither is placenta of any קדשים sanctified
- (a) Note: he must hold that are only sanctified at birth
- (i) And: ר"א (the author) infers from impossible cases (e.g. אשם – only male) i.e. דנין אפשר משאי אפשר
- 5 just as any leftovers were burnt – but no live animals included
- (a) So too: all קדשים – any living “leftovers” (e.g. אשם שנתכפרו בעליו) aren't burned, but graze etc.
- 6 just as שלמים can generate and become פיגול, so too with all קרבנות

- iii *Alternate version of ר"ע (only replacing מנחה, חטאת and אשם)*
- 1 *מנחה*: just as *מנחה* sanctifies others via *בליעה*, so too all *קרבנות*
 - (a) *Justification*: if only written in re: *מנחה*, *סד"א* because it is soft, it is *בולע* – not *חטאת*
 - (i) *And if*: only written in re: *חטאת*, *סד"א* because it is “bubbly” with fat it is *בולע*, not so with *מנחה*
 - 2 *חטאת*: just as *חטאת* must be brought from *חולין*, during the day and with his right hand, so too all *קרבנות*
 - (b) *Sources*:
 - (i) *חולין* v. 9 – must be his, not from communal funds, nor from *מעשר*
 - (ii) *גיוס*: is inferred from general phrase in v. 10 (*a*: it was mentioned inadvertently)
 - (iii) *יד ימין*: inferred from *אצבע* and *כהונה* (*a*: mentioned inadvertently)
 - 3 *אשם*: just as bones of *אשם* are permitted, so too with all *קרבנות*
- iv *Question*: how does ר"ע interpret v. 1?
- 1 *Answer*: uses it (per *רבה בר אבוה*) to teach that *פסח* (surplus funds) are to be brought as *שלמים*
 - 2 *Challenge*: that is inferred (per *אבוה דשמואל*) from v. 11
 - (a) *Interpretation*: that which comes from *צאן* (i.e. *פסח*) will come as *שלמים*
 - (b) *Challenge*: we derive it from v. 12 (*ברייתא*), teaching that any surplus of *פסח* (*פסח* whose year lapsed, or *נסכים*, *סמיכה*, *ח"ש*) *שלמים* that come on account of *פסח* that they require all *מצות* associated with *שלמים*
 - (i) *And*: only lamb requires *אליה*, not goat (v. 13)
 - 3 *Answer*: there are three sources:
 - (a) *One*: for a case where the *פסח*'s year lapsed and it is currently after *פסח*
 - (b) *Two*: for a case where the *פסח*'s year didn't yet lapse, but it is after *פסח*
 - (i) *Justification*: we may have thought that since it is fit for *פסח שני*, can't be *שלמים* – *קמ"ל*
 - (c) *Three*: for a case where neither the year nor *פסח* has lapsed
 - (i) *Case*: where it was lost, another designated for *פסח* and it was found before midday of *יד*
 - (ii) *Justification*: we might have thought that since it is perfectly fit for *פסח*, can't be *שלמים* – *קמ"ל*