

29.1.8; 9b (קמץ בשמאל) → 10b (קמ"ל)



- I Analysis of the invalidity of using the left hand for קמיצה
- a Source (זירא) v. 1 – כף (without R/L indicator) means “R” – per vv. 2-5
    - i Note: we don't apply מיעוט אחר מיעוט here, as there are four mentions of שמאל
    - ii Challenge: why not let vv. 2-5 set model – that every כף is L?
    - iii Answer: four mentions delimit that this is the only place where L is called for (a la כתובים הבאים כאחד)
  - b Question (ירמיה) (ר' ירמיה): why the mention of R (vv. 6-7) if the default is R?
    - i Answer: one allows for צדדין (side of finger) the other to disqualify inside of finger (כהן is on nail-side)
  - c Question: why על דם האשם and על דם האשם (vv. 6-7)?
    - i Justification: על דם would indicate that it must be there; על מקום may indicate that דם itself is a חציצה – קמ"ל – חציצה
  - d דבא: the multiple mentions of ימין (vv. 6-7) set up גז"ש for:
    - i קמיצה v. 1 – must be with right hand
    - ii חליצה v. 8 – must be on right foot
    - iii דעינה v. 9 – must be in right ear
    - iv Question: what is purpose of שמאלית (v. 3)?
      - 1 Answer: to disqualify R, which we would have thought would be valid via ק"י (R always preferred)
        - (a) And: שמאל in v. 5 as well as ימין in v. 7 – per תדבר"י – repetition only for שנתחדש
- II רשב"ל (quoted by רבב"ח): wherever it states כהונה and אצבע – must be R-only
- a assumption: require both אצבע & כהן (v. 10) & we infer from מצורע (v. 3 where אצבע and כהן are there, explicit מינית)
    - i challenge: קמיצה only states כהן (no אצבע); yet our משנה rules that it is invalid
    - ii rather (רבא): require either אצבע or כהן
      - 1 challenge (אב"י): taking אברים to ramp (v. 11), states כהן, yet he brings them with left hand
      - 2 answer: אצבע or כהן are enough for those עבודות that are indispensable for כפרה following lead of מצורע
        - (a) challenge: קבלה is indispensable for כפרה, only says כהן and ר"ש permits (in אב"י: ב) if done with שמאל
        - (b) answer: ר"ש requires both אצבע and כהן
          - (i) challenge: ר"ש himself states that "יד" and "אצבע" always mean "R"
          - (ii) answer: ר"ש holds that "כהן" requires "אצבע/יד", but "אצבע/יד" doesn't require "כהן"
            - 1. question: then (to ר"ש), why write כהן at all?
            - 2. answer: that they must be בכיהונן (i.e. בבגדי כהונה)
          - (iii) challenge: ר"ש doesn't dispute that זרה"ד, which only states כהן, requires ימין (he doesn't dispute ב:א)
          - (iv) answer: he does disagree (ברייטא)
    - (c) challenge: רבא's observation that רגל ואוזן יד, רגל ואוזן (all R) are used for גז"ש
      - (i) answer: one is needed to teach that קמיצה is with R; other for קידוש קומץ (in כלי שרת) done with R
    - (d) question: according to ר"ש, who (perhaps) doesn't require קידוש קומץ at all (מנחות ג:ד) – why the need for יד::יד?
      - (i) and even: for those אמוראים who maintain that he does require it – he validates if done with L (יד::יד?)
      - (ii) and: cannot be for the קמיצה itself (since he rejects ר' יוחנן who says ר', as we've seen), since he learns that from v. 5:
        - 1. אשם is compared to חטאת and to מנחה:
          - a. if: he chooses to do it without a כלי, uses R like חטאת
          - b. and if: he chooses to do it with כלי, uses L like אשם
        - 2. answer: needed for קמיצה of חטאת
          - a. since: ר"ש explains that מנחת חטאת doesn't have oil or frankincense, so that it shouldn't be "beautiful", he may hold that קמיצה בימין is valid
          - b. therefore: יד::יד extends requirement of קמיצה בימין to חטאת as well.