

30.8.6

109a (משנה ג) → 110b (אחוינא לך חורפאי)

- I **משנה ג**: how to properly prepare the udder (milk) and the heart (blood)
- a *In both cases*: tear it open and remove the offending substance
- b *Post facto*: if he didn't tear it open, he isn't culpable for ingesting a prohibited food
- II רב's ruling about an udder that wasn't torn
- a *Version 1*: if not torn, he may eat it **לכתחילה**
- i *Challenge*: wording of **משנה** – אינו עובר עליו – implies that it is **אסור**
- ii *Defense*: that wording is parallel to **סיפא** re: **לב**, which, if he doesn't tear open, is certainly **לכתחילה**
- 1 *Support*: **ברייתא** with variation – **כחל** – same as **משנה**; **לב** – if he didn't tear it open, must tear after cooking
- 2 *Challenge*: perhaps only the heart has the "fix" of tearing afterwards and udder is irreparable
- b *Version 2*: if not torn, he may not eat it **לכתחילה** – just isn't culpable if he does so
- i *Support*: wording of **משנה** – אינו עובר עליו – implies that it is **אסור**
- ii *Block*: that wording is parallel to **סיפא** re: **לב**, which, if he doesn't tear open, is certainly **לכתחילה**
- 1 *challenge*: **ברייתא** with variation – **כחל** – same as **משנה**; **לב** – if he didn't tear it open, must tear after cooking
- 2 *block*: perhaps only the heart has the "fix" of tearing afterwards and udder is irreparable
- c **ברייתא** supporting version 1:
- i **ברייתא**: if an udder is cooked with its milk – **מותר**; but a stomach cooked with its (ingested) milk – **אסור**
- 1 *Explanation*: ingested milk is in the intestines; udder's milk didn't yet leave the teat
- III Method of tearing open
- a **דב יהודה**: tear widthwise and lengthwise and push it against the wall (to get out all the milk residue)
- i *Story*: **אלעזר** ר' told his servant just to rip it open and he would eat (→ no need for **שתי וערב** or pushing against wall)
- ii *Story*: **ילתא** ר"נ (her husband) that everything forbidden by the **תורה** has a "permitted release"
- 1 *Examples*: blood/liver; **דם טוהר/דם נדה**; fats/fats of a **חיה**; pig **שיבוטא/גירותא**; **לישנא דבכוורא/גירותא**; married woman/a divorcee while her husband lives; sister-in-law/**יבמה**; non-Jewess/**תואר**
- 2 *Her demand*: she wants to eat "**בשר בחלב**" (-ish)
- 3 *Response*: ר"נ ordered the cooks to skewer and roast her an udder
- (a) *Challenge*: our **משנה** teaches that it must first be ripped open and milk cleaned out
- (i) *Defense*: that is for cooking – not roasting
- (b) *Challenge*: the **ברייתא** says "if it was cooked" – implying only **בדיעבד** (**כשר**)
- (i) *Defense*: also means **לכתחילה**; language is parallel to **קבה**, which is **אסור**, **רישא** was also taught **בדיעבד**
- IV Reassessing רב's opinion (version 2- **כחל** is **אסור** **לכתחילה** if cooked with milk inside)
- a *Story*: ר"א came to ר"א, asked if a **תנא** had taught the ruling (**אסור**) before רב
- i *Response*: **תנא** reported that רב generated the **איסור** when he overheard that people in a particular town weren't careful about **בב"ח**
- ii *Alternate version* (**ר' יוסי בר אבא**): **תנא** taught **איסור** only in case of a nursing animal (**חלב** was already out) to **חייא** ר'
- 1 *But*: ר"ח assumed his students (**רב**) to be sharp and taught it without qualification and he misunderstood
- b *Story*: **רבינ** ר' (both from ר"א) came to רב's house and were served **כחל**; **ריב"י** ate, while **רבין** refused
- i *Comment*: **ריב"י** pointed out that ר' **פפי** (of ר"א's father-in-law; he must have learned it from him)
- V **סורא** v. **יהודה** and the saga of **רמי בר תמרי** of **פומבדיתא**
- a *Background*: in **סורא**, they did not eat **כחל**; in **פומבדיתא**, they did eat **כחל**
- b *He arrived*: in **סורא** on **עי"כ** and everyone was throwing their **כחל** out (after slaughtering animals for **סעודה**)
- i **דב"ת**: ate them and was summoned to **חסדא** ר', who asked him why he ate **כחל**
- ii *His answer*: he's from **פומבדיתא**, **יהודה**, רב's town, where they eat **כחל**
- 1 *Challenge* (**ר"ח**): he must accept **חומרות** of town he is visiting (per **ד:א**) (*a*: was outside of town limits)
- 2 *Question*: what did he use (out there) for fuel for his fire? (*a*: he found grape seeds and fired them up)
- 3 *Challenge*: perhaps they were from **יין נסך** (*a*: they were over 12 months old (lapsed))
- 4 *Challenge*: perhaps they were the property of others → **גזילה** (*a*: there was **יאוש בעלים** (they had grown wild))
- 5 *Challenge*: why doesn't he wear **תפילין** (*a*: he has stomach ailment – ר"י ruled that **חולי מעיים** is exempt from **תפילין**)
- 6 *Challenge*: why doesn't he wear **ציצית** (*a*: his garment is borrowed; ר"י ruled that **מן הציצית** is exempt from **ציצית**)
- iii *While talking*: they brought a man before ר"ח who wasn't honoring parents and prepared to flog him
- 1 **דב"ת**: indicated that they should let him be – any **מצוה** which has a reward in the **תורה** is not actionable by **ב"ד**
- (a) *Reaction*: ר"ח was impressed by his sharpness
- (b) *Response* (**ר"ב**): if he came to **פומבדיתא**, he'd see very sharp people (**רב יהודה**)