

30.7.6

96a (מסנה ב) → 97a (ליטעמיה קפילא ארמאה)

Note: 96a is presented in our editions with *מסנה ה* – but since our *סוגיא* will not address *מסנה ה* for a few pages, we will only present *מסנה ד* here and then *מסנה ה* when the *גמרא* addresses it

1. על פן לא יאכלו בני ישראל את גיד הנשה אשר על כף הירך עד היום הזה כי נגע בכף ירך יעקב בגיד הנשה: בראשית לב, לג

- I **מסנה ב**: various parametric concerns regarding גיד הנשה
- a *Removal*: all must be removed
- i *Dissent*: ר' יהודה – only enough to fulfill מצוות נטילה
- b *Analysis*: story – גה"נ was cutting שוחט directed him to cut further; consoled him that he was right יהודה ר' לשיטת ר' יהודה
- i *מסנה ה* insists that *מסנה ד* all must be cut out
- II **מסנה ג**: *Liability for eating*: if one eats כזית of it – liable
- a *However*: if one eats a complete גיד which is less than כזית – still liable
- i *Dissent*: ר' יהודה – not liable without eating כזית
- b *If*: he ate כזית from each of the left and right – gets 2 sets of מכות
- i *Dissent*: ר' יהודה – only one set
- III **Analysis**: *שמואל* – תורה only forbade that which is at the hip – per v. 1
- a *מסנה ד*: this follows the dispute in our *מסנה ד*
- i *מסנה ד*: it is a בריה → liable even if less than כזית *מסנה ד*
- ii *מסנה ד*: v. 1 uses אכילה → must be כזית
- 1 *מסנה ד*: that is used to teach that eating a כזית of 1 גיד is also a violation
- 2 *מסנה ד*: infers that from כף הירך (v. 1)
- (a) *מסנה ד*: use that phrase as per *מסנה ד*
- (b) *מסנה ד*: הירך=the **entire** thigh
- (i) הירך *מסנה ד* – the גיד that courses through entire thigh (inner one); but only at כף
- (ii) *Challenge*: כף needed to exclude bird, which has no כף
- (iii) *Answer*: there are two instances of כף in v. 2 → both can be inferred
- IV **מסנה ד**: if a thigh is cooked with the גיד in it, if the גיד flavors the thigh it is אסור
- a *Measure*: use ratio of meat (::גיד) to a turnip (::ירך)
- b *Caveat* (*שמואל*): thigh is only אסור if גיד was cooked, but if it was roasted, cut the thigh and eat it until reaching the גיד
- i *Challenge*: ר' הונא ruled that if a kid was roasted with its חלב inside, the entire גדי (even its ear) is אסור
- ii *Defense*: חלב is different than a גיד – it bubbles
- 1 *Challenge*: ר' יוחנן had a case come before him with a kid roasted with its fat inside and he ruled that they may cut the meat off and eat it until they reach the fat
- (a) *Defense*: that was a skinny goat without much fat
- (b) *Variation1*: it was a kidney that was roasted – the membrane keeps the fat from moving out
- (c) *Variation2*: it was דגים טמאים in a pot, and ר' יוחנן directed that they have a non-Jewish cook taste it