

30.8.6

109a (משנה ג) → 110b (אחוינא לך חורפאי)

- I **ג** משנה: how to properly prepare the udder (milk) and the heart (blood)
- a *In both cases*: tear it open and remove the offending substance
- b *Post facto*: if he didn't tear it open, he isn't culpable for ingesting a prohibited food
- II רב's ruling about an udder that wasn't torn
- a *Version 1*: if not torn, he may eat it לכתחילה
- i *Challenge*: wording of משנה – אינו עובר עליו – implies that it is אסור
- ii *Defense*: that wording is parallel to סיפא re: לב, which, if he doesn't tear open, is certainly אסור לכתחילה
- 1 *Support*: אסור ברייתא with variation – כחל – same as משנה; לב – if he didn't tear it open, must tear after cooking
- 2 *Challenge*: perhaps only the heart has the "fix" of tearing afterwards and udder is irreparable
- b *Version 2*: if not torn, he may not eat it לכתחילה – just isn't culpable if he does so
- i *Support*: wording of משנה – אינו עובר עליו – implies that it is אסור
- ii *Block*: that wording is parallel to סיפא re: לב, which, if he doesn't tear open, is certainly אסור לכתחילה
- 1 *challenge*: אסור ברייתא with variation – כחל – same as משנה; לב – if he didn't tear it open, must tear after cooking
- 2 *block*: perhaps only the heart has the "fix" of tearing afterwards and udder is irreparable
- c **ברייתא** supporting version 1:
- i **ברייתא**: if an udder is cooked with its milk – מותר; but a stomach cooked with its (ingested) milk – אסור
- 1 *Explanation*: ingested milk is in the intestines; udder's milk didn't yet leave the teat
- III Method of tearing open
- a **דב יהודה**: tear widthwise and lengthwise and push it against the wall (to get out all the milk residue)
- i *Story*: ר' אלעזר told his servant just to rip it open and he would eat (→ no need for שתי וערב or pushing against wall)
- ii *Story*: ר' יתא told ר' (her husband) that everything forbidden by the תורה has a "permitted release"
- 1 *Examples*: blood/liver; דם; טוהר/דם נדה; חיה; pig/שיבוטא; גירותא; לישנא דבכוורא/גירותא; married woman/a divorcee while her husband lives; sister-in-law/יבמה; non-Jewess/יתת תואר
- 2 *Her demand*: she wants to eat "בשר בחלב" (-ish)
- 3 *Response*: ר' ordered the cooks to skewer and roast her an udder
- (a) *Challenge*: our משנה teaches that it must first be ripped open and milk cleaned out
- (i) *Defense*: that is for cooking – not roasting
- (b) *Challenge*: the ברייתא says "if it was cooked" – implying only בדיעבד (כשר)
- (i) *Defense*: also means לכתחילה; language is parallel to קבה, which is אסור, רישא was also taught בדיעבד
- IV Reassessing רב's opinion (version 2- אסור לכתחילה is כחל if cooked with milk inside)
- a *Story*: ר' א"י came to ר' א"י, asked if א"י had taught the ruling (אסור) before רב
- i *Response*: רב reported that רב generated the אסור when he overheard that people in a particular town weren't careful about בב"ח
- ii *Alternate version* (ר' יוסי בר אבא): ר' א"י taught אסור only in case of a nursing animal (חלב was already out) to ר' חייא
- 1 *But*: ר"ח assumed his students (רב) to be sharp and taught it without qualification and he misunderstood
- b *Story*: רב יצחק בר יוסף ורבין (both from ר' א"י) came to ר' פפי's house and were served כחל; ר' א"י ate, while רבין refused
- i *Comment*: ר' יצחק בר יוסף pointed out that ר' פפי was ר' א"י's father-in-law; he must have learned it from him
- V סורא v. פומבדיתא and the saga of רמי בר תמרי of רב's city (יהודה)
- a *Background*: in סורא, they did not eat כחל; in פומבדיתא, they did eat כחל
- b *He arrived*: in סורא on עיר"כ and everyone was throwing their כחל out (after slaughtering animals for סעודה)
- i **דב"ת**: ate them and was summoned to חסדא, ר' חסדא, who asked him why he ate כחל
- ii *His answer*: he's from פומבדיתא, יהודה, רב's town, where they eat כחל
- 1 *Challenge* (ר"ח): he must accept חומרות of town he is visiting (per פסחים ד: א: (a: was outside of town limits)
- 2 *Question*: what did he use (out there) for fuel for his fire? (a: he found grape seeds and fired them up)
- 3 *Challenge*: perhaps they were from יין נסך (a: they were over 12 months old (lapsed))
- 4 *Challenge*: perhaps they were the property of others → גזילה (a: there was יאוש בעלים (they had grown wild))
- 5 *Challenge*: why doesn't he wear תפילין (a: he has stomach ailment – ר"י ruled חולי מעיים is exempt from תפילין)
- 6 *Challenge*: why doesn't he wear ציצית (a: his garment is borrowed; ר"י ruled that חציצת מן פטורה מן הציצית)
- iii *While talking*: they brought a man before ר"ח who wasn't honoring parents and prepared to flog him
- 1 **דב"ת**: indicated that they should let him be – any מצוה which has a reward in the תורה is not actionable by ב"ד
- (a) *Reaction*: ר"ח was impressed by his sharpness
- (b) *Response* (ר' יתא): if he came to פומבדיתא, he'd see very sharp people (רב יהודה)